
REPUBLIC OF KENYA
MURANG'A COUNTY ASSEMBLY
THE HANSARD

Tuesday, January 31st, 2023

The House met at 11:08 a.m.

[The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha) in the Chair]

PRAYER

PAPER

THE PUBLIC FINANCE (MURANG'A COUNTY AGRICULTURAL FARM INPUTS SUBSIDY
AND INCENTIVES FUND) GUIDELINES 2023

Hon. Moses Muchiri: Thank you, Mr. Speaker, I am the Member of County Assembly (MCA) for Muguru Ward, and the Chairperson Murang'a County Delegated Legislation Committee. I beg to lay the following Paper;-

That, the Public Finance (Murang'a County Agricultural Farm Inputs Subsidy and Incentives Fund) Guidelines 2023, be laid on the Table of the Assembly today 31st January 2023.

(Hon. Moses Muchiri did not lay the Paper on the Table)

Hon. Moses Muchiri: Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Please lay the Paper, Hon. Muchiri.

(Hon. Moses Muchiri laid the Paper on the Table)

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Next Order.

NOTICES MOTION

STANDARDIZATION OF ISSUANCE OF BURSARY

Hon. Naomi Maina: Thank you, Mr. Speaker, I represent Ruchu Ward and I am the Chairperson for the Education and Child welfare Committee. Pursuant to the provision of Standing Order 53, I beg to withdraw the notice of Motion on standardization of issuance of bursary to the

needy students in the County. This is to enable further consultation with the Members of the Assembly, the Education Committee, and also, to align the Motion with the provisions of Murang'a County Scholarship Fund Act, 2014.

(Applause)

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Thank you, Hon. Naomi. Pursuant to Standing Order 53 (1), a notice of Motion may be withdrawn by a Member who gave the Notice but Notice of the same Motion may be given again, either by the same or by any other Member. Paragraph two, despite paragraph one, Notice of Special Motion may not be withdrawn except with the leave of the Assembly. I hereby grant you and request that you expedite and bring that business as quickly as possible for us to schedule. Next Order.

(The Motion was withdrawn)

MURANG'A COUNTY EARLY CHILDHOOD DEVELOPMENT EDUCATION (ECDE) SCHOOL FEEDING PROGRAM

Hon. Steven Muigai: Thank you, Mr. Speaker, I am the MCA for Kakuzi/Mitumbiri Ward and I beg to give the following notice of Motion;-

Aware that, every child has a right to basic nutrition and health care as stipulated in Article 53 (c) of the Constitution of Kenya 2010, and that pre-primary education is a devolved function of the County Government as provided in Part Two of the Fourth Schedule of the Constitution of Kenya 2010, informed that in his inaugural speech to the County Assembly, the Governor, His Excellency Dr. Irungu Kangata, undertook to enhance early childhood development in the County through re-establishment of the porridge program for Early childhood Development Education (ECDE) learners to boost class attendance and participation, appreciating that provision of a nutritional balanced porridge meal will promote and improve the nutritional needs of all pupils in ECDE centers in the County and will further enhance enrollment level at the centers, cognizant of the fact that the County Executive successfully initiated a pilot project on provision of porridge in Early Childhood Development (ECDE) centers in 17 wards; this Assembly approves that,

- a. The County Executive Committee Member (CECM) in charge of Education and Technical Training, rolls out the Murang'a County ECDE porridge school feeding program to all ECDE centers in the County.
- b. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Next order.

MOTION

MURANG'A COUNTY EARLY CHILDHOOD DEVELOPMENT EDUCATION (ECDE) SCHOOL FEEDING PROGRAM

Hon. Steven Muigai: Thank you, Mr. Speaker, I am the MCA for Kakuzi/Mitumbiri Ward and I beg to move the following Motion; Aware that, every child has a right to basic nutrition and health care as stipulated in Article 53 (c) of the Constitution of Kenya 2010, and that pre-primary education is a devolved function of the County Government as provided in Part Two of the Fourth Schedule of the Constitution of Kenya 2010, informed that in his inaugural speech to the County Assembly, His Excellency Governor Dr. Irungu Kangata undertook to enhance early childhood development in the County through re-establishment of the porridge program for Early childhood Development Education (ECDE) learners to boost class attendance and participation, appreciating that provision of a nutritional balanced porridge meal will promote and improve the nutritional needs to all pupils in ECDE centers in the County and will further enhance enrollment level at the centers, cognizant of the fact that the County Executive successfully initiated a pilot project on provision of porridge in Early Childhood Development (ECDE) centers in 17 wards; this Assembly approves that,

- a. The County Executive Committee Member (CECM) in charge of Education and Technical Training, rolls out the Murang'a County ECDE porridge school feeding program to all ECDE centers in the County.

Mr. Speaker allow me to move this Motion. One, Mr. Speaker, you must be aware that ECDEs is a devolved function as per the fourth Schedule of the Constitution of Kenya and the County Assembly should therefore strengthen its legislative role in enhancing the ECD. Mr. Speaker this Motion is aimed at providing a legal framework on the implementation on the ECD programs. Mr. Speaker you should also know note that our County has experienced droughts in over the last six months thus meaning children are malnourished and unable to concentrate in class. Mr. Speaker there is saying that goes that a 'hungry man is an angry man' and there is

another one in Spanish that says 'ngaragu ndihoyagwo uhoro' and I would like to see that we roll out the feeding program because it is going to help in enhancing school enrollment as well as their capacity to concentrate.

Mr. Speaker let me go back to the point where we all agree that we have had our seasons failing, we have had shortage of rains and even at the moment Mr. Speaker you can agree with me that the clouds are not looking promising and of course that is not a good sign to our constituents and so if it happens that we support our children then it means we are going to improve their education.

Mr. Speaker, I understand that you are a Bible reader and, in this case, a Christian and furthermore a born again Christian, Mr. Speaker praise God and in Mathew 19 verse 14, the Bible says that and this I quote the Bible, it reads; 'Let the Children come to me and do not hinder them for the kingdom of God belongs to such as these''

This is a call to the Assembly and to the Members of the County Assembly to see that we pass this Motion and take care of this gift that we have been given by God and by so he gave an example by allowing the children go to him. So, in this case Mr. Speaker we have set aside Kshs60 Million as a budget for this program and it is my prayer that we hasten this process to begin. In our County we have 650 ECDE centers and at the moment we are having an enrollment of 41,375 learners in all these centers.

Mr. Speaker going forward and if we happen to put our best foot forward and say that we start this program it means we are going to have an increase in these learners in our ECDEs. I would like to move this Motion and have it supported by the members to see that we start it, we roll it out so that we can begin. Thank you Mr. Speaker. And I would like to call Hon. Mark Wainaina to second the Motion. Thank you.

Hon. Mark Wainaina: Thank you Mr. Speaker. I rise to second this Motion in regards to Murang'a County ECDE school feeding program.

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Thank you Hon. Members.

(Question proposed)

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Hon. Members the Floor is open for debate

Hon. Edwin Wairagu: Thank you Mr. Speaker. The Motion is well read by the MCA *mheshimiwa* (honorable) Muigai but there are some issues as we proceed the debate, perhaps I

think it is in order first of all to clear the issue of the Spanish saying because that saying even if you google you cannot find it in Spanish language so Mr. Speaker that one should be really looked at because this thing is really read all over.

Then the other thing is about, the mover of the Motion really said it so well that we want to come up with a legal framework particularly to provide this porridge to our children. My concern here is that, if we are talking about the legal issues, legal framework and there is a sentence here which reads that “Re-establishment of the porridge program for the ECDE.” Mr. Speaker that’s page no. 2 of the Notice of Motion. My concern is about the reestablishment. I would want maybe to be clarified through your guidance on whether there is any existing law on this porridge program, for this one sentence, the one word which says reestablishment because it appears as if it is something that has been in existence and therefore, we do not have to have overriding rules and Laws. If there is a Law to this, let us follow that law if there is no law then we proceed, that is the clarification I do want. Because finally we know that this thing will end up to become a Bill or maybe we come up with a Policy and we do not now to keep repeating something that has been there. That’s concern.

And again I think it is also good for us members and also member from Kakuzi to realize that this country is a sovereign state and per our Constitution 2010 Article 8, Kenya has no single religion and it is a secular religion as it is and I know with my little knowledge that Speaker of this Assembly represents the faces of every member who is here whether you are a Christian, whether you are religious or not, therefore I do not think it is in order Mr. Speaker to deviate from the common norm of this 2010 Constitution Article 8 either to say that Mr. Speaker, he is a Christian. Let’s avoid that so that somebody will feel as if his rights are not represented. Thank you Mr. Speaker.

(Laughter)

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Hon. John Munyua

Hon. John Munyua: Thank you Mr. Speaker for this opportunity. First of all, I would like to say I am supporting the project because it is within our mandate as MCAs or as the County Government of Murang’a and as much as we can use for this project, it is worth it, but I have some reservations about two wards that stated that they are not supporting the project. That is Murarandia and Muguru. I hope it is in record and I would like to be guided what will happen in those two wards. Whether they will have milk if that is what they want.

(Hon. Kibe Wasary on point of order)

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Hon. Leader of Majority, what is the point of order?

Hon. Kibe Wasary: Hon. Speaker, Hon. Munyua is referring to Hon. Munga and Hon. Moses on their behalf but they have not talked on the same on behalf of themselves.

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Yes Honourable, let the members since they are present prosecute their case deal with your end.

Hon. John Munyua: Okay. The other thing I wanted to know is how long the contract will run? We need to have that clarification because we can change along the way. Thank you Mr. Speaker.

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Yes Moses.

Hon. Moses Muchiri: Thank you Mr. Speaker, I stand to oppose this Motion on the basis that I consider this policy to be worse than the policies which were passed by the former regime like that of *thaara* (Napier Grass), *mirio* (Sweet Potatoes vines) because there is no way we can allow a policy that is proposing that we have one kitchen in each and every ward, then we cook porridge and transport porridge to our children in ECDE-----

(Hon. Morris Thuku rose on a point of order)

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Yes Whip.

Hon. Morris Thuku: Thank you Mr. Speaker, can Member for Muguru clarify whether we have such a policy for *thaara* (napier grass), *mirio* (sweet potatoes vines) for him to mention it in his defence.

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Yes Moses, please clarify the policy on those two.

Hon. Moses Muchiri: Thank you Hon. Speaker, those were some of the policies implemented by the former regime that of *thaara* (napier grass), it is in public domain, that of *mirio* (sweet potato vines) and *thumu* (manure) it is in public domain that former government used to provide common *mwananchi* (citizen) with the same. And I consider those policies to be better

than this one of the porridge because of the health issues. I think the porridge we are telling our pupils in the wards to drink I dare an Honourable Member from this Assembly to drink or eat the same porridge or allow your children to eat the same porridge.

In my case Hon. Speaker, my main role in this Assembly is representation. I did two public participation in my ward, that is Muguru Ward. It was attended by parents, the ECDE teachers and members of public and what they were proposing is that each and every ... (*technical hitch*)....

What I am saying is that in my ward we have 23 ECDE centres and in those 23 ECDE centres we have 1500 ECDE learners. So, each and every ECDE school already have one independent kitchen and a staff who was cooking the porridge as well as the food for the children so telling them to close their kitchens and have one centralized kitchen where we cook the hot porridge and distribute it using motor bikes that is very risky to the health of our children. We know sometimes there may be an outbreak of disease like the cholera or may be the porridge can even be poisoned by politicians may be those in opposition and wit that will be very risky to our children. We do not want a case where a learner may die or get sick.

What my electorates in Muguru were proposing is that if we really want to help them, the only thing we can do is to supplement them by giving them the porridge flour so that they can cook for themselves or we give them a packet of milk which will be secure for our children....(*technical hitch*).....

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Is it recording? Hon. Muchiri please approach the Table and speak from there

Hon. Moses Muchiri: Lastly Hon. Speaker, we have very bad roads in our wards so considering a scenario where a rider will be given five *mitungis* (jerricans) of porridge to take to children and may e it is raining. As I wind up, I was looking at a scenario where the *boda boda* (motorcycle) rider will go may be to the kitchen then be given like five *mitungis* (jerricans) of porridge to take to the ECDE centres and if there is bad network to those ECDE centres, the *boda boda* (motorcycle) rider will have to park the porridge on where the tarmac road is then carry the Jerri can of porridge may be of two kilometres to take to those schools. When it is raining the *mitungis* (jerricans) will be very muddy, the rider can fall and I am looking at such a scenario and it can be very risky to our children. Thank you Mr. Speaker, I stand to oppose.

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Hon. Kabeera.

Hon. Kabera James: Mr. Speaker Sir, as I Second this Motion

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Are you seconding? It was seconded before.

Hon. Kabera James: No, as I support the Motion I want to say it is good to start this program because in each and every situation we have positive and negative sides and as it goes by we will rectify the mistakes which will be there. I wish if that program was to come tomorrow in Kamahuha and I will implement it. Thank you.

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Hon. Hillary.

Hon. Hillary Muigai: Thank you Mr. Speaker, I rise to support this Motion according to what I have come to learn in 17 wards this program has been piloted with the involvement of the chairperson Education who is with us in this Assembly---

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Please come forward and use the microphone in the Table.

Hon. Hillary Muigai: I support this Motion by the fact that the program has been piloted in 17 wards and actually we have not heard of any complaint and it has been a success, that is the reason I believe through the relevant Committee it has been able to reach to this Assembly Floor. In my ward Ichagaki this is a very good program when it starts because I believe my ECDE pupils will be able to have enough time for the school program. As we embark on feeding them I know very well it will be a success and it is our mandate as County Government to make sure we take care of these ECDE so that they can be able to enjoy when they are in school. Thank you.

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Hon. Architect Ruiru

Hon. Ruiru Bernard: Thank you Mr. Speaker, on this matter I think it is important for us as members of this House, in as much as we understand that there will definitely be challenges facing this program; that we admit that it would only be prudent if we first roll out the program and then understand the challenges that would come with the program itself.

Even as I stand to support this Motion, it does not necessarily mean that it does not pose challenges to the people of my ward but I decide to remain optimistic to this program knowing very well that probably a few months down the line we will definitely sit down and carry out evaluations across the entire County and at that point we will be objective in understanding challenges that we will be facing as a County rather than maybe now we will only be making assumptions of the challenges that we will face. Even if we try to come up with solutions these solutions will be based on assumptions and not facts.

It is my understanding that in my opinion and also representing people of my area that we would wish that we first roll out the program then a few months down the line maybe one term, through the assistance of the chair and the leadership, that we sit down and carry out an objective evaluation of the program by then we will be in informed position to decide whether to continue with the program or otherwise. I stand to support thank you.

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Hon. Kibaiya.

Hon. John Ngugi: Thank you Mr. Speaker for granting me this opportunity. First, I would want to declare that I am in support of this Motion but with a rider. We cannot be risk indifferent when it comes to our children. As most of the members here have said they are supporting the program though they have some concerns. I think it would have been better if the executive were to have brought a policy rather than a Motion so that it can spell the duties and responsibilities of every person who would be involved in that infrastructure of providing *uji* (porridge) to our kids. I can tell that members are in support of this Motion but I am also dubious of whether we have laid out proper structures to make this a reality. Outside of the concerns that we have as members there are concerns out there by the members of the public and I think this Motion is very simplistic because it does not tell us how to do it so I would urge the Committee on Education to pursue this matter further with Executive so that they can come up with a substantive policy that provides for the duties and responsibilities of every person that is involved in this infrastructure. I also would want to know whether there are performance contracts that are made between the riders, the cooks and the executive. With those concerns and having aired them on this the 31st day of January 2023 I support but with but.

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Hon. Elizabeth.

Hon. Warisper Elizabeth: Thank you Mr. Speaker sir for granting me this chance to support the Motion and while I support, I want to remind our people that school feeding program is so essential because it will increase the attention span hence the better school academic achievement. I want to remind our honourable members that we did pilot program and we did like public participation in every ward and we considered all what it pertains concerning the *uji* (porridge) program. I stand to support this program and I say it is very timely. Thank you.

(Hon. John Ngugi rose on a point of Order)

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Yes Hon. Kibaiya what is the point of order?

Hon. John Ngugi: Thank you Mr. Speaker Sir can the Honorable member for Kimorori/Wempa confine the public participation part to her ward because there was no public participation done in my ward.

Hon. Warisper Elizabeth: Thank you Honourable Speaker to my ward I did a public participation and I involved my people, the parents and the people of the necessary ECDE schools and those involved in carrying, the riders, that is the *boda boda* (motorbike) and the cooks. That is the public participation I did. Maybe in your ward or any other ward they did not but in my ward I did it that is the clarification to my ward.

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Yes Hon. Pauline.

Hon. Pauline Njeri: Thank you Honourable Speaker Sir, I stand to support this Motion but with a lot of reservations. It is very wise for what members did and everyone who was involved in coming up with this ECDE feeding program. For sure we understand most kids have been missing schools especially for the last six months due to the hunger that has been in our country, but, as a mother Hon. Speaker I have reservations because of hygiene. I do not understand why we are not cooking this porridge from the schools where the children are studying because this raises a very high risk of hygiene, you can imagine this porridge is being cooked from elsewhere and being transported by people we do not know, as much as we vetted them in terms of employment we don't know how they are, I do not know the people who are cooking this porridge, the hygiene measures that have been put in place and like I said I am a mother and if one of my kid, a boy takes anything that is dirty, this boy will always diarrhoea and I want to imagine this porridge being cooked from elsewhere, what is going to happen to the big number of students because it's not one person who is cooking, it's not one person who is transporting this porridge and for that reason, I would really wish we come up with some hygiene measures or a policy on how this porridge is going to meet the hygiene measures and is not going to lead our children to diarrhoea and all manner of things, so I support with the reservations of hygiene. Thank you Mr. Speaker.

Hon. Jane Mukami: Thank you Mr. Speaker. I rise to support the school feeding program since I am a mother and porridge is more nutritious than milk or any other supplements, thank you.

Hon. Peter Munga: Thank you Mr. Speaker. This is the first time in the Floor of the House and I rise to air my views towards the Motion on the Floor. In my ward we did public participation with the ECDE teachers and parents and something came up. In my ward all the 18 ECDEs those

kids take *uji* or rather porridge and take lunch, meaning they have employed one parent to cook for them. The issue that rose on is this one, if you take to them cooked *uji* or ready porridge are you going to unemploy those cooks? No. Simply because those kids are going to eat at lunch time so the cook must be there, meaning by taking them ready porridge you are not helping them unless maybe the government or the county government we say we are helping the parents by saying we are paying the cooks for them by saying we are taking the porridge to them. So in my ward what they propose is that the feeding program is good but I am not rejecting it they opted that they are given the flour to cook or rather as the county government we assist the parents by paying for them the cooks so that the reservations most of them have said. Let us be honest members most of us are in for the porridge to be transported because we are creating job opportunities otherwise everyone would be against this, thank you Mr. speaker.

Hon. Moses Mirara: Mr. Speaker I stand to support this *uji* (porridge) program and I say these words, it is a well thought out project and first of all I want to allay the fears of the Honorable member, the nominated member from Maragua that there would be problems of hygiene. I do understand that the handlers of this *uji* (porridge) are like the riders, the cooks are always seeking for food handling certificates and that makes it clear that they will provide good hygiene. Nevertheless, I want to say that we cannot fail to support this project because our children are having a lot of problems, we cannot stop it because of challenges like those of road networks and whatever. There is nothing devoid of challenges Mr. Speaker and if we do not start this project now we won't be objective to get the challenges at hand and maybe seek measures to mitigate them. Thank you Mr. speaker.

Hon. Naomi Maina: Thank you Mr. Speaker. I rise to support this Motion on Murang'a ECDE feeding program and as the chairperson education, I would like to confirm that the program had been piloted in all 17 wards and I am also waiting to roll out or we have a great milestone of rolling out in all the 35 wards where the 41000 kids will benefit. Mr. Speaker I can also confirm that the porridge is hygienically prepared, sealed and distributed. Mr. Speaker I support once again this well thought initiative of supporting our children in education. Thank you Mr. Speaker.

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): I now call the mover to respond

Hon. Steven Muigai: Thank you Mr. Speaker and I would like to appreciate the spirit that is in this House in handling this debate so positively. Mr. Speaker I had prepared a defence to one of the Honorable members, Hon. Moses from Muguru ward and I don't know somehow, he sensed

and he decided to leave so I may not respond to him but allow me first of all appreciate the contribution that has been done by most of our members including Hon. Wairagu from Gitugi ward.

I would like to respond one by saying Hon. Wairagu, I did not by any way mean to diminish or to demean your religion. I know you are a believer of Legio Maria and for this matter, an elder in that denomination I only wanted to emphasize on what I know, my Speaker believes in and even by reminding him that even in this House that he should lead us in a Christian way because we believe that it is the right way.

Mr. Speaker allow me to respond also to a concern that was raised by one honourable member Hon. Munyua about the budget that we have set aside and contract that we have laid down. Mr. Speaker we have already done a budget of sixth million towards this project and there is an NGO (Non-Government Organization) or an organization that already decided and agreed with our proposal to come and do a pilot project and so if we agree as a County Assembly and if it happens that the county executive finds it proper to give them a contract, they are the ones going to be given the contract until the next financial year.

Mr. Speaker allow me also to inform the members of this House and remind them as it has been alluded by one Honorable wa Risper that this program had been rolled out as a pilot project in 17 of our 35 wards in this County and in all this 17 wards Mr. Speaker one of the wards and where we did the launch was in my ward. I have sat down with most of the members who had the pilot and I have not heard any issue. Mr. Speaker, when some of the members rise here and talk about unhygiene and talk about the behaviour of riders, I find it diminishing and I find it not proper, because in this House we have one rider who has risen to the occasion and has become a nominated MCA, that is Hon. Manucho, so any time you refer to riders in a negative way, I want you to understand you will be hurting this young man who is very much devoted in working for this County. I would like us to agree that any rider that we will contract, will be a man of the same stature as our honourable member, Hon. Hon. Manucho.

Mr. Speaker allow me to also inform this House that even the water that we are drinking now, we are not sure of the origin. We are not sure of who packaged it and we are not sure whether it is the right sample of water that we are supposed to be taking. But honourable members are comfortably taking it. I would like to say this, that one, those young men that we are going to contract to do the transport and those ladies we are going to contract to do the preparation, we are

going to make sure that we have taken them through thorough medical check up to make sure that your boy Hon. Pauline, doesn't diarrhoea as you have mentioned.

Mr Speaker, allow me to also remind Mr. Kibaiya that we are not going to run this programme as a County alone, that we are going to get a partner, that is an NGO (if we find it fit, or someone else or any other organization to help us do it.

I congratulate my young brother Hon. Peter Munga for having being elected and serving such an organized ward. When I listen to how your ward is organized, I see a rich ward and I admire to be a MCA in that ward. I would like to ask Hon. Peter Munga allows other wards, especially where Hon. Ndunda comes from, where they cannot afford the three meals per day, if we happen to give them that cup of *uji* (porridge), if Hon. Peter Munga allows, we can take his share to Ithanga to make sure we serve those children in Ithanga ward. Maybe give them a double portion. If you do that, it will be prudent and of cause a blessing to you.

Mr. Speaker, I do not want to belabour so much on this Motion but I would like to appreciate. I would like to say that we are not reintroducing this program, what we are doing is to re-establish. We want to revamp it. In the last regime, they were issuing *unga* (flour) to the ECDE and they were cooking but what we want to do is to repackage it and make sure we do it in the confines of the law. That is why we have brought it in the Assembly so that we can pass it and package it properly. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

(Question put and agreed to)

ADJOURNMENT

The Speaker (Hon. Johnson Mukuha): Honourable members this House now stands adjourned until such a time that shall be notified by notice.

The House rose at 12: 02 p.m.